

1 ROBERT W. FERGUSON  
Attorney General

2 RENE D. TOMISSER, WSBA #17509  
3 Senior Counsel  
JEFFREY T. SPRUNG, WSBA #23607  
4 ZACHARY P. JONES, WSBA #44557  
JOSHUA WEISSMAN, WSBA #42648  
5 PAUL M. CRISALLI, WSBA #40681  
NATHAN K. BAYS, WSBA #43025  
6 BRYAN M.S. OVENS, WSBA #32901  
Assistant Attorneys General  
7 8127 W. Klamath Court, Suite A  
Kennewick, WA 99336  
8 (509) 734-7285

9 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
10 EASTERN DISTRICT OF WASHINGTON  
AT RICHLAND

11 STATE OF WASHINGTON, et al.,

12 Plaintiffs,

13 v.

14 UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT  
OF HOMELAND SECURITY, a  
15 federal agency, et al.

16 Defendants.

NO. 4:19-cv-05210-RMP

DECLARATION OF M. NORMAN  
OLIVER IN SUPPORT OF  
PLAINTIFF STATES' MOTION  
FOR § 705 STAY PENDING  
JUDICIAL REVIEW OR FOR  
PRELIMINARY INJUNCTION

NOTED FOR: October 3, 2019  
With Oral Argument at 10:00 a.m.

1 I, M. Norman Oliver, declare as follows:

2 1. I am over the age of 18, competent to testify as to the matters herein  
3 and make this declaration based on my personal knowledge.

4 2. I submit this Declaration in support of the Commonwealth of  
5 Virginia's litigation against the United States Department of Homeland Security  
6 regarding the recently issued rule entitled Inadmissibility on Public Charge  
7 Grounds (Final Rule). I have compiled the information in the statements set forth  
8 below either through personal knowledge, through the Virginia Department of  
9 Health (VDH) personnel who have assisted me in gathering this information, or  
10 on the basis of documents that I have reviewed. I have also familiarized myself  
11 with the Final Rule in order to understand its immediate impact upon VDH.

12 3. I serve as the State Health Commissioner for the Virginia  
13 Department of Health ("VDH"). I have served in this capacity since April 2018.  
14 Prior to my appointment, I served as the Deputy Commissioner for Population  
15 Health for the Virginia Department of Health where I worked with other state  
16 agencies and healthcare systems across the state to improve the health and well-  
17 being of all Virginia residents. I also served as the Walter M. Seward Professor  
18 and Chair of the Department of Family Medicine at the University of Virginia  
19 School of Medicine where I helped lead the transformation of the Department's  
20 clinic sites into patient-centered practices focused on population health.

21 4. The VDH is one of twelve state agencies within Virginia's Secretary  
22

1 of Health and Human Resources, and is responsible for the oversight and  
2 administration of programs serving Virginia's most vulnerable residents.

3 5. As the State Health Commissioner for the VDH, I oversee Virginia's  
4 statewide public health agency consisting of approximately 3,700 full-time  
5 employees and an annual budget of more than \$700 million.

6 6. The mission of the VDH is to protect the health and promote the  
7 well-being of all people in Virginia. The goals of the VDH include maintaining  
8 a competent and valued work force; fostering healthy, connected and resilient  
9 communities; being a trusted source of public health information and services;  
10 assuring the conditions that improve health opportunity; and providing internal  
11 systems that deliver consistent and responsive support.

12 7. VDH serves as the leader and coordinator of Virginia's public health  
13 system, providing services the protect and promote the health of all of the  
14 Commonwealth's residents and visitors. Generally, VDH services are delivered to  
15 the public by local health departments (LHDs) or by VDH field offices. Each city  
16 & county in Virginia is required to establish and maintain a LHD. Pursuant to  
17 statutory authority, VDH has organized these 119 LHDs into 35 health districts.  
18 Local health districts provide a variety of services, including the Supplemental  
19 Nutrition Program for Women, Infants and Children (WIC), family planning, breast  
20 and cervical cancer screening, and immunization.

21 8. I understand that the U.S. Department of Homeland Security (DHS)  
22



1 has issued a new regulation on the public charge ground of inadmissibility under  
2 the Immigration and Nationality Act, which I have reviewed. As I understand it,  
3 the Final Rule would allow the federal government to expand its consideration of  
4 a person's past use of public benefits and future need for public assistance in  
5 determining whether someone should be eligible for lawful permanent residency,  
6 a new visa, or for an extension of stay or change of stay from an existing visa. I  
7 understand that DHS would consider use of one of several specific benefits for a  
8 duration of 12 months within a 36 month period to be a heavily weighted negative  
9 factor in a public charge determination. Most critically, these factors include  
10 programs crucial to resident's health and basic needs, such as the Newcomer's  
11 Health Program

12 9. As a result of that change, I believe the Final Rule will cause  
13 immigrants to forego public benefits that are included within the list specified by  
14 the Final Rule so as to avoid adverse immigration consequences, despite such  
15 benefits being allowed under federal and state law. I also believe that several  
16 groups of immigrants will withdraw from public benefits despite not being  
17 actually covered by the Final Rule, including: (i) immigrants who are not subject  
18 to the public charge test, such as refugees, and (ii) immigrants who are  
19 disenrolling even from services that are not included in the public charge  
20 determination.

21 **Description of Relevant Program(s)**  
22

1           10. The WIC Program serves low-income pregnant, postpartum and  
2 breastfeeding women, infants and children up to the age of five who are at  
3 nutritional risk. WIC provides participants with nutrition education, nutritious  
4 foods, breastfeeding promotion and support, and referrals to health and other  
5 social services. Research has shown WIC has helped to improve birth outcomes  
6 and savings in health care costs, diet and diet-related outcomes, infant feeding  
7 practices, immunization rates, and cognitive development. Current Virginia WIC  
8 participation is approximately 110,000. Most recent national data shows  
9 enrollment by race for the WIC program: 58.63% White; 20.75% Black/African  
10 American, 10.29% American Indian/Alaskan Natives, 5.77% Multiple Race.  
11 Ethnicity percentages are as follows: 41.8% Hispanic/Latino and 58.1% Non-  
12 Hispanic/Latino. Enrollment by category is as follows: 23.35% women; 23.33%  
13 infants; and 53.32% children.

14           The Title X Family Planning Program is the only federal program  
15 dedicated solely to the provision of family planning and related preventive health  
16 services. VDH is currently the only Title X grantee in Virginia. VDH uses Title  
17 X funds to support services at local health districts across the Commonwealth, as  
18 well as one federally qualified health center (FQHC) in Rockbridge, Virginia. In  
19 the majority of Virginia localities, Title X service sites are the only publicly  
20 funded providers of comprehensive family planning services. Given the role of  
21 contraception in preventing unintended pregnancies, the Guttmacher Institute  
22



1 estimates that \$7.09 is saved for every public dollar spent on family planning  
2 services. In 2018, 38,021 patients received Title X services at the Virginia  
3 Department of Health, ultimately preventing 8,170 unintended pregnancies  
4 (Source: Guttmacher Institute Data Center). Of these patients, 34,805 (92%) were  
5 living at or below 200% of the federal poverty level; 25,586 (67%) were  
6 uninsured; 5,603 (15%) were teens; 12,152 received cervical cancer screenings  
7 (pap tests); 7,333 received breast cancer screenings (clinical breast exams); and  
8 12,904 were tested for chlamydia, the most commonly reported infectious disease  
9 in the United States.

10 The Every Woman's Life Program (EWL), administered through VDH's  
11 Office of Family Health Services with funding from the Centers for Disease  
12 Control and Prevention, began in 1997 and provides access to free, high-quality  
13 breast and cervical cancer screening and diagnostic services. Screening and early  
14 detection reduces death rates, improves treatment options, and greatly increases  
15 survival and quality of life. The program serves approximately 6,000 individuals  
16 annually and has provided breast and cervical services to over 60,000 Virginians  
17 since its inception in 1997. The program serves low-income, uninsured Virginia  
18 women between the ages of 18-64.

19 Immunizations are proven to be one of the most cost-effective clinical  
20 preventive services. Communities with under-immunized populations are at  
21 increased risk for outbreaks of vaccine-preventable diseases. Through the  
22

1 provision of immunization services, the VDH Office of Epidemiology aims  
2 to reduce morbidity and mortality associated with communicable diseases. The  
3 primary approach to preventing vaccine-preventable diseases is to assure high  
4 vaccination rates throughout the Commonwealth. VDH administers three  
5 programs that aim to increase access to vaccines: Virginia Vaccines for Children,  
6 Virginia Vaccines for Adults, and Virginia Perinatal Hepatitis B. These programs  
7 provide vaccines in collaboration with private and public providers. Eligibility  
8 for these programs target those who otherwise would not be able to afford  
9 vaccines, including those who are under or uninsured, or on Medicaid.  
10 Combined, VDH provides 1.4 million doses of vaccine to approximately 850,000  
11 eligible patients annually.

12 11. The VDH work unit for the Virginia WIC Program is the Division  
13 of Community Nutrition Services within the Office of Family Health Services  
14 and local health districts. The Title X Family Planning Program work unit is the  
15 Division Child and Family Health within the Office of Family Health Services  
16 and local health districts. The Every Woman's Life Program work unit is the  
17 Division of Prevention and Health Promotion within the Office of Family Health  
18 Services. EWL is administered through twenty-four provider sites across  
19 Virginia, including large health systems, academic centers, free clinics, FQHCs,  
20 and VDH local health districts. The Division of Immunization within the Office  
21 of Epidemiology, in partnership with VDH's 35 local health districts, provides  
22



1 immunization services to the Commonwealth.

2 12. Figures provided in section 10 regarding the number of individuals  
3 served in the Virginia WIC, Title X Family Planning and Every Woman's Life  
4 Programs are based on actual program enrollment and participation data. Figures  
5 provided in section 10 regarding the number of individuals served by the  
6 immunization program is based on actual program participation data.

7 13. The Virginia WIC Program does not require citizenship information  
8 from participants for eligibility determination. Even though WIC is not included in  
9 public charge determinations, many program participants do not understand the  
10 differences in food benefit and community nutrition programs and many assume  
11 that WIC services are impacted by public charge determination along with food  
12 benefits, such as SNAP. WIC providers serving communities with large immigrant  
13 populations routinely provide feedback that participants request discontinuation of  
14 WIC services due to fear of the federal administration's immigration policies. This  
15 new rule will likely result in negative impacts to program participation, increased  
16 inquiries for clarification on how the rule impacts participant eligibility and the need  
17 for training of WIC providers to share up to date and accurate information.

18 14. Title X providers must offer services to patients regardless of  
19 residency status or income and must never refuse care due to inability to pay. Title  
20 X providers are expected to provide patient-centered counseling to all patients  
21 seeking family planning services and to make strong referrals to other support  
22



1 services as appropriate. As a result of the Final Charge Rule, Title X providers will  
2 need additional training on the practical implications of this regulation and will need  
3 to share this information with patients. VDH predicts that this rule will result in  
4 patient fear of retribution and make them less likely to seek support services to  
5 which they are entitled. While the Title X Family Planning Program is not explicitly  
6 included in public charge inadmissibility determinations, many patients do not  
7 understand the nuances of federal funding and may assume that they are no longer  
8 eligible for Title X services because of this rule. Title X providers working in areas  
9 with a large immigrant population regularly share that some immigrant patients are  
10 afraid to seek services from government agencies due to the federal administration's  
11 immigration policies. This new rule will likely result in increased inquiries from the  
12 public attempting to understand the implications of the rule, as well as a drop in  
13 patient participation.

14       15.       While being a resident of Virginia is a factor of program eligibility  
15 for EWL, an individual's citizenship status is not taken into account when  
16 determining eligibility for the program. EWL serves undocumented individuals  
17 that meet program eligibility. Women who are enrolled in EWL and diagnosed  
18 with breast or cervical cancer may be eligible for Medicaid coverage for treatment  
19 through the Breast and Cervical Cancer Prevention Treatment Act  
20 (BCCPTA). Eligibility for the BCCPTA is determined by local Virginia  
21 Departments of Social Services and women must meet Virginia Medicaid non-  
22

1 financial eligibility requirements, which include: 1) being age 18-64; 2) being a  
2 Virginia resident; 3) being a U.S. citizen or meeting Virginia alien requirements; 4)  
3 not being eligible for Medicaid under another covered group; and 5) not having  
4 creditable health insurance. Consequently, some individuals may not be eligible  
5 for Medicaid treatment coverage through the BCCPTA because of their citizenship  
6 status. Due to the differences in how citizenship impacts program eligibility  
7 between BCCTPA and EWL, many patients may assume that they are no longer  
8 eligible for EWL services because of this rule.

9       16. An individual's citizenship status is not taken into account when  
10 providing immunization services. VDH predicts that this rule will result in patient  
11 fear of retribution and make them less likely to seek immunization services when  
12 needed.

### 13       **Harms to Agency Mission or Broader Harms**

14       17. The Final Rule will have a significant negative impact on the VDH's  
15 mission to protect the health and promote the well-being of all people in Virginia.

16       18. Public health services to Virginia communities will be adversely  
17 affected as part of the downstream, ripple effects of the Rule.

18       19. The Rule will have a very deleterious effect on the health of  
19 immigrant populations and the health of the Commonwealth, as a whole. As such,  
20 the changes pose a public health threat.

21       20. As non-citizens are forced or feel forced to disenroll from these vital  
22



1 health assistance programs out of fear of jeopardizing their legal status because  
2 of changes in the Rule, we can expect a number of adverse effects to result.

3 21. First, People will die. The anxiety and fear generated in the  
4 immigrant population will lead to people not seeking care for emergent  
5 conditions (heart attacks, for example).

6 22. We can also expect to see worse health outcomes, especially for  
7 pregnant or breastfeeding women, infants, and children. There will be reduced  
8 prescription adherence, as well.

9 23. We can expect to see an increased use of emergency rooms and  
10 emergent care as a method of primary healthcare due to avoiding treatment in  
11 primary-care or health department settings.

12 24. We can expect to see an increased prevalence of communicable  
13 diseases, including among members of the U.S. citizen population who are not  
14 vaccinated.

15 25. We can expect to see increases in uncompensated care in which a  
16 treatment or service is not paid for by an insurer or patient.

### 17 **Administrative Challenges**

18 26. The Virginia WIC Program previously experienced challenges in  
19 communicating the changes of the Public Charge Rule. Program staff  
20 participated in webinars and conference calls to gain a better understanding in  
21 order to provide clarification to WIC clinic staff and the public that the Virginia  
22



1 WIC Program was not included in the regulation's inadmissibility  
2 determinations. It is likely that, once the final rule is implemented, VDH  
3 programs will face similar challenges in responding to inquiries and  
4 communicating which public health programs are affected, as well as those that  
5 are not, and the resulting impact on immigrant populations.

6 I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the Commonwealth of  
7 Virginia and the United States that the foregoing is true and correct.

8 DATED this 30th day of August, 2019, at Charlottesville, Virginia.

9  
10 

11 M. Norman Oliver, M.D., M.A.  
12 State Health Commissioner,  
13 Virginia Department of Health  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22

**DECLARATION OF SERVICE**

I hereby declare that on this day I caused the foregoing document to be electronically filed with the Clerk of the Court using the Court's CM/ECF System which will serve a copy of this document upon all counsel of record.

DATED this 6th day of September, 2019, at Tumwater, Washington.

/s/ Sara M. Cearley  
SARA M. CEARLEY  
Paralegal